

Numerical analysis: numerical integration

Dr. Dmitry Batenkov

April 18, 2021

1 Approximating the integral by interpolating polynomials

We would like to compute approximation to $I(f) = \int_a^b f(x) dx$, by using values of $f(x)$ at a finite number of points $\{x_0, \dots, x_n\}$. This need arises in the following scenarios:

- It is impossible to compute the indefinite integral
- $f(x)$ is given by its samples and not an explicit formula.
- Other “tricks” don’t work

One common approach is to approximate f by its interpolation polynomial, and then compute the integral of this polynomial:

$$f(x) = P_n(x) + e(x) = P_n(x) + f[x_0, \dots, x_n, x] \underbrace{q_{n+1}(x)}_{\prod_{k=0}^n (x-x_k)}$$
$$\int_a^b f(x) dx = \int_a^b P_n(x) dx + \int_a^b e(x) dx = \underbrace{\int_a^b P_n(x) dx}_{\text{the approximation}} + \underbrace{\int_a^b f[x_0, x_1, \dots, x_n, x] q_{n+1}(x) dx}_{E(I(f))} \quad (1)$$

Let us now consider different important special cases where the error formula can be simplified.

Case A: $q_{n+1}(x)$ has constant sign in $[a, b]$. We can use the following result (without proof):

Claim 1. Let f, g be continuous in $[a, b]$. Without loss of generality, $h(x) \geq 0$ for $x \in [a, b]$. Then $\exists c \in [a, b]$ s.t.

$$\int_a^b g(x)h(x)dx = g(c) \int_a^b h(x)dx.$$

Corollary 1. If q_{n+1} has constant sign in $[a, b]$ then $\exists c, \xi \in [a, b]$ s.t. (recall Claim 5 from Lectures 1-3)

$$E(I(f)) = f[x_0, x_1, \dots, x_n, c] \int_a^b q_{n+1}(x) dx = \frac{f^{(n+1)}(\xi)}{(n+1)!} \int_a^b q_{n+1}(x) dx. \quad (2)$$

Putting $h = b - a$ we get $|q_{n+1}(x)| \leq Ch^{n+1}$ and therefore $|E(I(f))| \leq C_1 h^{n+2}$.

Example 1 (Rectangle rule). Consider $P_0(x) = f(a)$, then

$$\int_a^b f(x)dx = \int_a^b P_0(x)dx + \int_a^b f[a, x]\psi(x)dx = \underbrace{(b-a)f(a)}_{\text{Rectangle Integration Rule}} + \underbrace{\int_a^b f[a, x](x-a)dx}_{\text{error}}.$$

Since $q_1(x) = (x-a) \geq 0$ we are in **Case A** and so (as before, $h = b-a$)

$$E(I(f)) = f[a, c] \int_a^b (x-a)dx = f'(\xi) \left[\frac{(x-a)^2}{2} \right]_a^b = \frac{(b-a)^2}{2} f'(\xi) = \frac{h^2}{2} f'(\xi).$$

So we got a scheme of approximation order=2.

Case B: $\int_a^b q_{n+1}(x)dx = 0$. In this case for every x_{n+1}

$$\begin{aligned} f[x_0, x_1, \dots, x_n, x_{n+1}, x] &= \frac{f[x_0, x_1, \dots, x_n, x] - f[x_0, x_1, \dots, x_n, x_{n+1}]}{x - x_{n+1}} \\ f[x_0, x_1, \dots, x_n, x] &= f[x_0, x_1, \dots, x_n, x_{n+1}] + f[x_0, x_1, \dots, x_n, x_{n+1}, x](x - x_{n+1}) \\ E(I(f)) &= \int_a^b f[x_0, x_1, \dots, x_n, x] q_{n+1}(x) dx \\ &= \int_a^b \{f[x_0, x_1, \dots, x_n, x_{n+1}] + f[x_0, x_1, \dots, x_n, x_{n+1}, x](x - x_{n+1})\} q_{n+1}(x) dx \\ &= \int_a^b f[x_0, x_1, \dots, x_n, x_{n+1}, x](x - x_{n+1}) q_{n+1}(x) dx. \end{aligned}$$

Now if we can choose x_{n+1} s.t. $(x - x_{n+1}) q_{n+1}(x)$ has constant sign in $[a, b]$, then as in Corollary 1 above we get further simplification:

$$E(I(f)) = f[x_0, x_1, \dots, x_n, x_{n+1}, c] \int_a^b (x - x_{n+1}) q_{n+1}(x) dx = \frac{f^{(n+2)}(\xi)}{(n+2)!} \int_a^b (x - x_{n+1}) q_{n+1}(x) dx. \quad (3)$$

In a similar fashion, for $h = b-a$ we get $|(x - x_{n+1}) q_{n+1}(x)| \leq Ch^{n+2}$ and $|E(I(f))| \leq C_1 h^{n+3}$. So the scheme has approximation order $n+3$, higher than in **Case A**.

Example 2. Still order $n = 0$ but computing $P_0(x)$ using the point $x_0 = \frac{a+b}{2}$, i.e. $P_0(x) = f\left(\frac{a+b}{2}\right)$. We get

$$\begin{aligned} \int_a^b f(x)dx &= \int_a^b P_0(x)dx + \int_a^b f\left[\frac{a+b}{2}, x\right] q_1(x)dx. \\ &= \underbrace{(b-a)f\left(\frac{a+b}{2}\right)}_{\text{Midpoint Integration Rule}} + \underbrace{\int_a^b f\left[\frac{a+b}{2}, x\right] \left(x - \frac{a+b}{2}\right) dx}_{\text{error}}. \end{aligned}$$

Since $\int_a^b q_1(x) dx = \int_a^b (x - \frac{a+b}{2}) dx = 0$ we are in **Case B**. Choose $x_1 = x_0$, then $(x - x_1) q_1(x) = (x - x_0)^2$ has constant sign, therefore

$$\begin{aligned} E(I(f)) &= \int_a^b f \left[\frac{a+b}{2}, \frac{a+b}{2}, x \right] \left(x - \frac{a+b}{2} \right)^2 dx \\ &= f \left[\frac{a+b}{2}, \frac{a+b}{2}, c \right] \int_a^b \left(x - \frac{a+b}{2} \right)^2 dx \\ &= \frac{f^{(2)}(\xi)}{2!} \left[\frac{\left(x - \frac{a+b}{2} \right)^3}{3} \right]_a^b \\ &= \frac{f^{(2)}(\xi)(b-a)^3}{24}. \end{aligned}$$

With $h = b - a$ we get $E(I(f)) = \frac{h^3}{24} f''(\xi)$, i.e. a scheme of approximation order=3, by using the same number of points as in the Rectangle rule!

Example 3 (Trapezoidal Rule). Now we use $n = 1$ with endpoints $x_0 = a, x_1 = b$.

$$\begin{aligned} P_1(x) &= f(a) + f[a, b](x - a) = f(a) + \frac{f(b) - f(a)}{b - a}(x - a) \\ \int_a^b P_1(x) dx &= f(a)(b - a) + \frac{f(b) - f(a)}{2}(b - a) = \frac{f(a) + f(b)}{2}(b - a) \quad \Leftarrow \text{Area of a trapezoid!} \\ \int_a^b f(x) dx &= \int_a^b P_1(x) dx + \int_a^b f[a, b, x] q_2(x) dx \\ &= \underbrace{\frac{b-a}{2}(f(a) + f(b))}_{\text{Trapezoidal Integration Rule}} + \underbrace{\int_a^b f[a, b, x](x - a)(x - b) dx}_{\text{error}}. \end{aligned}$$

Error computation: $q_2(x) = (x - a)(x - b) \leq 0$ so we are in **Case A**: $h = b - a$

$$E(I(f)) = \frac{f''(\xi)}{2} \int_a^b q_2(x) dx = -\frac{f''(\xi)}{12} h^3.$$

Thus approximation order=3.

2 Method of undetermined coefficients

Recall the definition of algebraic degree of exactness from Lecture 4. An alternative derivation seeks a scheme of the form

$$I(f) = \int_a^b f(x) dx \approx \sum_{i=0}^n A_i f(x_i) = \tilde{I}(f)$$

which should have algebraic degree of exactness at least n . Thus it should be exact for $f = 1, x, \dots, x^n$. This implies that $\{A_0, \dots, A_n\}$ should satisfy the linear system of equations

$$\begin{aligned} I(1) &= \int_a^b 1 dx = b - a = A_0 \cdot 1 + A_1 \cdot 1 + \dots + A_n \cdot 1 \\ I(x) &= \int_a^b x dx = \frac{b^2}{2} - \frac{a^2}{2} = A_0 x_0 + A_1 x_1 + \dots + A_n x_n \\ &\dots\dots\dots \\ I(x^n) &= \int_a^b x^n dx = \frac{b^{n+1} - a^{n+1}}{n+1} = A_0 x_0^n + A_1 x_1^n + \dots + A_n x_n^n \end{aligned}$$

Indeed, if $I(f) = \tilde{I}(f)$ for $f = 1, x, \dots, x^n$ then $I(f) = \tilde{I}(f)$ for all $f \in \Pi_n$ by linearity (both I, \tilde{I} are linear operators). Alternatively, we can construct the system as above for any linearly independent set $\{p_1, p_2, \dots, p_n\}$ which spans Π_n .

Claim 2. The schemes thus obtained are equivalent to the ones derived via explicit form of P_n , and so the error formula (1) holds.

Proof. From the form of the system of equations above, there is always a unique solution $\{A_0, \dots, A_n\}$ for every choice of pairwise distinct $\{x_0, \dots, x_n\}$ (why?) On the other hand, integrating the Lagrange form $P_n(x) = \sum_{i=0}^n f(x_i) \ell_i(x)$ we get

$$\hat{I}(f) = \int_a^b P_n(x) dx = \sum_{i=0}^n f(x_i) \underbrace{\int_a^b \ell_i(x) dx}_{:=B_i},$$

and this equation should also be exact for $\{1, x, \dots, x^n\}$. So $\{A_i\}_{i=0}^n$ and $\{B_i\}_{i=0}^n$ satisfy the same system of equations, thus $A_i = B_i$. \square

Example 4 (Simpson's Rule). $n = 2$, looking for coefficients A, B, C such that $\tilde{I}(f) = Af(a) + Bf(\frac{a+b}{2}) + Cf(b)$ has algebraic degree of exactness ≥ 2 . We get

$$\begin{cases} f(x) = 1 : & I(1) = \int_a^b 1 dx = b - a = A \cdot 1 + B \cdot 1 + C \cdot 1 \\ f(x) = x - a : & I(x - a) = \int_a^b (x - a) dx = \frac{(b-a)^2}{2} = A \cdot 0 + B \left(\frac{b-a}{2}\right) + C(b-a) \\ f(x) = (x - a)^2 : & I((x - a)^2) = \int_a^b (x - a)^2 dx = \frac{(b-a)^3}{3} = A \cdot 0 + B \left(\frac{b-a}{2}\right)^2 + C(b-a)^2 \end{cases}$$

Solving this we get $A = \frac{1}{6}(b - a)$, $B = \frac{4}{6}(b - a)$, $C = \frac{1}{6}(b - a)$, i.e.

$$I(f) = \int_a^b f(x) dx \approx \frac{b-a}{6} \left[f(a) + 4f\left(\frac{a+b}{2}\right) + f(b) \right] = \tilde{I}(f).$$

What is the algebraic degree of exactness? We know it's exact for $1, x, x^2$. Let's check for $f = x^3, x^4, \dots$ until there is no equality.

$$\begin{aligned} f(x) = (x - a)^3 : I(x^3) &= \int_a^b (x - a)^3 dx = \frac{(b - a)^4}{4} \\ \tilde{I}(x^3) &= \left(\frac{b-a}{6}\right) \cdot 0 + \frac{4(b-a)}{6} \underbrace{\left(\frac{b-a}{2}\right)^3}_{f((a+b)/2)} + \frac{b-a}{6} \underbrace{(b-a)^3}_{f(b)} = \frac{(b-a)^4}{4}. \end{aligned}$$

Check that $I(x^4) \neq \tilde{I}(x^4)$. So the algebraic degree of exactness=3.

Error computation: check that we are in **Case B**: $\int_a^b q_3(x)dx = \int_a^b (x-a)(x-b)(x-(a+b)/2)dx = 0$. Then choosing $x_{n+1} = x_3 = \frac{a+b}{2}$, we get that $q_3(x)(x-x_3)$ does not change sign, and so by (3) we have

$$\begin{aligned} I(f) &= \int_a^b f(x)dx = \underbrace{\int_a^b P_2(x)dx}_{I(P_2)} + \underbrace{\int_a^b f\left[a, b, \frac{a+b}{2}, x\right] \psi(x) dx}_{E(I(f))=error} = I(P_2) + E(I(f)) \\ &= \underbrace{\frac{b-a}{6} \left[f(a) + 4f\left(\frac{a+b}{2}\right) + f(b) \right]}_{I(f)=\text{Simpson's Integration Rule}} + \underbrace{\int_a^b f\left[a, b, \frac{a+b}{2}, x\right] (x-a)(x-b) \left(x - \frac{a+b}{2}\right)^2 dx}_{E(I(f))=error} \\ E(I(f)) &= \frac{f^{(4)}(\xi)}{24} \int_a^b (x-a)(x-b) \left(x - \frac{a+b}{2}\right)^2 dx \\ &= -\frac{f^{(4)}(\xi)(b-a)^5}{90 \cdot 2^5}. \end{aligned}$$

Put $b-a = 2h$ then $E(f) = -\frac{(2h)^5}{2^5 \cdot 90} f^{(4)}(\xi) = -\frac{h^5}{90} f^{(4)}(\xi)$ so approximation order=5.

Example 5 (Corrected Trapezoidal Rule). We can also use Hermite's interpolaton polynomial: $x_0 = x_1 = a, x_2 = x_3 = b$ so $n = 3$ and

$$\begin{aligned} P_3(x) &= f[a] + f[a, a](x-a) + f[a, a, b](x-a)^2 + f[a, a, b, b](x-a)^2(x-b) \\ &= f(a) + f'(a)(x-a) + \frac{(f(b) - f(a))/(b-a) - f'(a)}{b-a} (x-a)^2 + \\ &\quad + \frac{f'(b) - 2(f(b) - f(a))/(b-a) + f'(a)}{(b-a)^2} (x-a)^2(x-b) \\ \int_a^b f(x)dx &= \int_a^b P_3(x)dx + \int_a^b f[a, a, b, b, x]q_4(x)dx \\ \int_a^b P_3(x)dx &= \underbrace{\frac{b-a}{2} [f(a) + f(b)]}_{\text{Standard Trapezoidal rule}} + \frac{(b-a)^2}{12} [f'(a) - f'(b)] \quad \text{Corrected Trapezoidal Rule} \end{aligned}$$

Compared with the Trapezoidal Rule, we have additional terms involving derivatives. We get an improvement in the error order: since $q_4(x) = (x-a)^2(x-b)^2 \geq 0$ we are in **Case A**. Put $h = b-a$, then by (2)

$$\begin{aligned} E(I(f)) &= \frac{f^{(4)}(\xi)}{24} \underbrace{\int_a^b (x-a)^2(x-b)^2 dx}_{\frac{(b-a)^5}{30}} \\ &= \frac{h^5}{720} f^{(4)}(\xi), \end{aligned}$$

i.e. approximation order=5.

3 Composed/Composite Integration Rules

When $b - a$ is not small, the standard rules above will not result in a small error. Furthermore, as we mentioned in Interpolation Lecture Example 6, we may not even necessarily have $P_n \rightarrow f$ as $n \rightarrow \infty$ (for equispaced interpolation points). A standard method to reduce the error is to divide the interval $[a, b]$ into many sub-intervals (suppose with equispaced points)

$$a = x_0 < x_1 < \dots < x_{n-1} < x_n = b, \quad x_i - x_{i-1} = h, \quad i = 1, \dots, n,$$

$$h = \frac{b - a}{n}$$

approximate $I_i(f) = \int_{x_i}^{x_{i+1}} f(x) dx$ and then sum up the approximations. The errors will also be added.

Example 6 (Composed Trapezoidal Rule). We use the Trapezoidal Rule for each I_i :

$$\int_{x_i}^{x_{i+1}} f(x) dx = \underbrace{\frac{h}{2}(f(x_i) + f(x_{i+1}))}_{\text{Trapezoidal Integration Rule}} - \underbrace{\frac{f''(\xi_i)}{12}h^3}_{\text{error}}$$

$$\int_a^b f(x) dx = \frac{h}{2} \sum_{i=0}^{n-1} \{f(x_i) + f(x_{i+1})\} - \frac{h^3}{12} \sum_{i=0}^{n-1} f''(\xi_i)$$

Note that each point $\{x_i\}_{i=1}^{n-1}$ appears twice in the sum while the endpoints appear once:

$$\frac{h}{2} \sum_{i=0}^{n-1} \{f(x_i) + f(x_{i+1})\} = \frac{h}{2} \left\{ f(x_0) + 2 \sum_{i=1}^{n-1} f(x_i) + f(x_n) \right\}. \quad \text{Composed Trapezoidal Rule}$$

If $f''(x)$ is continuous in $[a, b]$ we can use the intermediate value theorem and estimate the overall error by

$$-\sum_{i=0}^{n-1} \frac{h^3}{12} f^{(2)}(\xi_i) = -\frac{nh^3}{12} \sum_{i=0}^{n-1} \frac{f''(\xi_i)}{n} = -\frac{(nh)h^2}{12} f''(\xi)$$

$$= -\frac{(b-a)h^2}{12} f''(\xi).$$

If $f''(x)$ is bounded but not necessarily continuous, $|f''(x)| \leq M_2$ then

$$|E(I(f))| \leq M_2 \sum_{i=0}^{n-1} \frac{h^3}{12} = n \frac{M_2 h^3}{12}$$

$$= \frac{M_2 h^2}{12}$$

so in any case the approximation order=2. Note that this is 1 less than the standard Trapezoidal Rule.

Similarly we can get the composed Simpson's rule.

Example 7 (Composed Simpson's rule). Now we need 3 points in each interval. So we divide $[a, b]$ into $2n$ intervals of equal length

$$a = \underbrace{x_0 < x_1 < x_2}_{\text{Interval for Simpson}} < \cdots < \underbrace{x_{2n-2} < x_{2n-1} < x_{2n}}_{\text{Interval for Simpson}} = b, \quad h = \frac{b-a}{2n}$$

and apply Simpson's rule in $[x_{2k-2}, x_{2k}]$ for $k = 1, 2, \dots, n$:

$$\begin{aligned} \int_a^b f(x)dx &= \sum_{k=1}^n \int_{x_{2k-2}}^{x_{2k}} f(x)dx = \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{2h}{6} [f(x_{2k-2}) + 4f(x_{2k-1}) + f(x_{2k})] + \sum_{k=1}^n E(I_k(f)) \\ &= \frac{b-a}{6n} \sum_{k=1}^n [f(x_{2k-2}) + 4f(x_{2k-1}) + f(x_{2k})] - \frac{h^5}{90} \sum_{k=1}^n f^{(4)}(c_k) \\ &= \frac{b-a}{6n} \left\{ f(x_0) + 2 \sum_{k=1}^{n-1} f(x_{2k}) + 4 \sum_{k=1}^n f(x_{2k-1}) + f(x_{2n}) \right\} - \frac{2nh}{180} h^4 \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{f^{(4)}(c_k)}{n} \\ &= \frac{h}{3} \underbrace{\left\{ f(x_0) + 2 \sum_{k=1}^{n-1} f(x_{2k}) + 4 \sum_{k=1}^n f(x_{2k-1}) + f(x_{2n}) \right\}}_{\text{Composed Simpson's Rule}} - \frac{b-a}{180} h^4 f^{(4)}(c). \end{aligned}$$

4 Sensitivity to errors in integration

Consider Composed Trapezoidal Rule:

$$T(h) = \frac{h}{2} \left\{ f(x_0) + 2 \sum_{i=1}^{n-1} f(x_i) + f(x_n) \right\}.$$

Suppose every $f(x_i)$ is known with some relative error $e_i = \frac{f(x_i) - \tilde{f}(x_i)}{f(x_i)}$ (this can be due to floating-point roundoff, measurement error etc.). Suppose $|e_i| \leq \varepsilon$. Then we compute

$$\begin{aligned} \tilde{T}(h) &= \frac{h}{2} \left\{ \tilde{f}(x_0) + 2 \sum_{i=1}^{n-1} \tilde{f}(x_i) + \tilde{f}(x_n) \right\} \\ |T(h) - \tilde{T}(h)| &= \frac{h}{2} \left\{ e_0 f(x_0) + 2 \sum_{i=1}^{n-1} e_i f(x_i) + e_n f(x_n) \right\} \\ &\leq nh\varepsilon \max_{x \in [a,b]} |f(x)| \\ &= (b-a)\varepsilon M_0 \end{aligned}$$

So we get overall error of the same order as every individual error, therefore the integration (in general) is insensitive to errors in data, and we can take $h \ll 1$ (this is not true for numerical differentiation!)